

Montana Transportation Commission

May 4, 2006 – Telephone Meeting

For additional information, please call (406) 444-7200 or visit the commission’s web site at http://www.mdt.mt.gov/pubinvolve/trans_comm/meetings.shtml. For the hearing impaired, the TTY number is (406) 444-7696 or 1-800-335-7592, or call the Montana Relay at 711. Alternative accessible formats of this document will be provided upon request.

Note: => indicates follow-up is needed.

The Montana Transportation Commission met via conference call on May 4, 2006. The meeting was called to order by Chairman Kennedy at 3:35 pm with the following participants:

- Bill Kennedy, Transportation Commission Chair (District 5)
- Nancy Espy, Transportation Commission Vice Chair (District 4)
- Rick Griffith, District 2 Transportation Commissioner
- Deb Kottel, District 3 Transportation Commissioner
- Jim Lynch, MDT Director
- Jim Currie, MDT Deputy Director
- Tim Reardon, MDT Chief Counsel
- Mark Wissinger, Construction Engineer
- Jim Walther, Preconstruction Engineer
- Ryan Dahlke, MDT District 5 Design Project Manager
- Lorelle Demont, Commission Secretary

Culvert repair – West of Hysham Interchange [IM 94-2(32)63]

Mark Wissinger presented information regarding the emergency culvert repair project on Interstate 94 west of Hysham. There were four bidders. The low bidder was Four Beers, Inc. of Columbus. There were no errors or omissions in the low bid which was 9.91 percent under our engineers’ estimate.

Commissioner Kottel moved to accept staff recommendations to award the project contract to Four Beers, Inc. in the amount of \$1,030,555.25; Commissioner Griffith seconded the motion. All four commissioners voted aye.

The commission thanked staff for their work to get the repair project underway so quickly. Lynch echoed the sentiment.

St. Regis – East & West (Structures) [IM 90-1(142)2]

This bridge deck repair project received no bids at the March 30 letting and was readvertised in the April 27 letting with provisions for an expedited award and notice to proceed.

There were two bids. The low bid was 32.9 percent above the engineers’ estimate. After talking with potential bidders following the March letting, staff determined that contract time was a concern because of the location of the project, and also that most bridge contractors were at or near capacity. The project was revised for the April letting by removing the A + B bidding, increasing contract time and revising the sequence of operations.

Wissinger noted that items with the most dollar variance are for the following: remove concrete pavement, latex modified concrete, concrete – class SD, reinforcing steel – epoxy coated, map & drill cracks, and mobilization. He reviewed those items and noted where we could justify amending the engineers’ estimate:

Bid item	Bid price	Engineers’ estimate	Analysis	Adjustment to engineers’ estimate
Remove concrete pavement	\$60 and \$18.75	\$25	The bid quantity is 12,901 square meters. We don’t have any bid history for this large a quantity. Prices received for smaller quantities range from \$25 to \$36. We cannot justify any adjustments to this item.	No adjustments

<i>Bid item</i>	<i>Bid price</i>	<i>Engineers' estimate</i>	<i>Analysis</i>	<i>Adjustment to engineers' estimate</i>
Concrete – latex modified	\$2,000 and \$785	\$800	This bid item was awarded at \$700 in the <i>Bozeman Area Seismic Retrofit</i> project, let in February. The quantity on this job is 448 cubic meters and the quantity for the Bozeman job was 980 cubic meters so we would anticipate a high price for a smaller quantity but we have never received over \$1,250 for this item. \$2,000 cannot be justified.	No adjustments
Class SD concrete	\$650	\$550	The quantity for this item is 3,292 cubic meters. The largest quantity in recent bid history was for 1074 cubic meters on the <i>Bitterroot – North of Hamilton</i> job let in January 2005; the awarded bid for this job was \$425. Given the recent increases in the concrete market, \$600 can be justified for this job.	+ \$164,600
Epoxy coated reinforcing steel	\$3.50 and \$2.14	\$2	The quantity for this item is 495,929 kg and we have never let a job with a quantity this large. On the <i>West Billings – King Avenue</i> bridges that was let in March, 2006 we had a quantity of 90,612 and the awarded bidder price (the awarded bidder was Sletten) was \$3. The awarded bid price for the <i>Big Horn River Hardin</i> job for a quantity of 80,166 kg was \$1.63. Typically for a larger quantity you receive a lower price, however we do not show any bid history with an awarded price of \$3.50. Recent bid history for larger quantities have been ranging from \$2.50 to \$3. Given the large quantity, \$2.50 can be justified for this project.	+ \$247,964.50
Map and drill cracks	\$2,000 and \$365	\$95	This item has only been used on one job, let in April 2004. The bids on that job ranged from \$50 to \$175. If we factor in some inflation, we can justify adjusting the engineers' estimate to \$200 for this item.	+ \$10,920
Mobilization			This increase reflects the adjustments made above	+ \$115,000
Total adjustments				+ \$538,485
Original engineers' estimate				\$12,037,667.22
Revised engineers' estimate				\$12,576,151.72

The low bid is 27.2 percent over the revised engineers' estimate. Although we can justify some revisions, we can't justify sufficient changes for the bid to be within guidelines for award. Staff recommended the commission reject the bids.

Commissioner Kottel moved to not award the project; Commissioner Espy seconded the motion. All four commissioners voted aye.

The call concluded at 3:50 pm.

Bill Kennedy, Chairman
Montana Transportation Commission

Jim Lynch, Director
Montana Department of Transportation

Lorelle Demont, Secretary
Montana Transportation Commission